

Therapeutic Intent/Healing Bibliography of Research

Compiled by Larry Dossey, M.D., and Stephan A. Schwartz

There is increasing evidence that consciousness can manifest nonlocally, at a distance, in ways that are health-relevant.

Jonas WB. The middle way: Realistic randomized controlled trials for the evaluation of spiritual healing. *The Journal of Alternative and Complementary Medicine*. 2001;7(1):5-7. A positive meta-analysis of studies in distant mental influence on animate and inanimate systems, including distant healing and prayer.

Astin JE, Harkness E, Ernst E. The efficacy of "distant healing": a systematic review of randomized trials. *Annals of Internal Medicine*. 2000;132:903-910. Of 23 studies in distant healing, 57% showed positive results. A cautiously positive systematic review.

Abbot, Neil C, Healing as a therapy for human disease: a systematic review, *Journal of Alternative and Complementary Medicine*, 2000, 6(2), 159-169. This meta-analysis covers 59 randomized controlled studies, (including 10 dissertation abstracts and 5 pilot studies) of healing in humans up to the year 2000. Of 22 fully reported trials, 10 suggested significant effects.

Braud, William and Schlitz, Marilyn. A methodology for the objective study of transpersonal imagery, *Journal of Scientific Exploration* 1989, 3(1), 43-63. This meta-analysis focuses on electrodermal activity (EDA), a measure of skin resistance that reflects states of tension. Healers have been able to selectively lower and raise EDA, aided by feedback from a meter attached to the healee's skin. In a series of studies by William Braud and Marilyn Schlitz there were 323 sessions with 4 experimenters, 62 influencers and 271 subjects. Of the 15 studies, 6, (40 per cent) produced significant results. Of the 323 sessions, 5 percent were successful ($p = .000023$). That is, such results could have occurred by chance only twenty three times in a million.

Schlitz, Marilyn/ Braud, William, Distant intentionality and healing: assessing the evidence, *Alternative Therapies* 1997, 3(6), 62-73. Analyzing 19 experiments in which one person sought to influence another person's electrodermal activity (EDA), they found highly significant effects ($p < .0000007$).

NONLOCAL MIND, DISTANT HEALING, AND PRAYER

© copyright by Larry Dossey, M.D.

The idea that the human mind is infinite or nonlocal - that at some level it cannot be confined to specific points in space, such as the brain and body, or in time, such as the present, is ancient.

One of the most universal expressions of nonlocal mind is prayer and distant healing. What is prayer? I define it arbitrarily and broadly as "communication with the Absolute," and I invite anyone to refine this definition in his or her own way. This definition is broad enough to encompass all the major religions including nontheistic traditions such as Buddhism, in which prayer is vital but is not directed to a personal god. Researchers who do experiments in the field of prayer-and-healing often prefer to use the term "distant

intentionality" instead of prayer in order to avoid religious connotations and to emphasize the purposeful, mental aspect of prayer. I shall follow the same practice, although I recognize that in Western cultures prayer usually occurs in a religious context.

Why should modern medicine concern itself with prayer and the nonlocal actions of human consciousness? (Dossey, 2000) Why should we be concerned about validating it and integrating these phenomena into healthcare? One might argue that such a phenomenon, even if it exists, ought to be set aside in favor of less challenging questions, such as whether or not one's thoughts or prayers can affect one's own body. There are compelling reasons to set our sights on the more elusive quarry at the outset. If distant effects of mental intentionality exist, we shall have to deal with them sooner or later, whether we like it or not. If we acknowledge them "up front," they may lend a comprehensiveness to our thinking about the dynamics of consciousness which otherwise would be sacrificed. Acknowledging these phenomena early on might spare us at some later date from having to retrofit our models in order to accommodate them, or perhaps having to scuttle our models altogether.

SIX QUESTIONS

In asking whether or not prayer or mental intentions can bring about changes in distant individuals, let's ask six questions. The evidence provided following each question is not exhaustive, but is intended to only suggest an answer.

(1) Does an effect exist? Is it possible - in principle - for individuals to influence, at a distance, the physiological function of a living organism?

(a) Ten subjects tried to inhibit the growth of fungus cultures in the laboratory through conscious intent by concentrating on them for fifteen minutes from a distance of approximately 1.5 yards. The cultures were then incubated for several more hours. Of a total of 194 culture dishes, 151 showed retarded growth (Barry, 1968).

(b) In a replication of this study, one group of subjects demonstrated the same effect (inhibiting the growth of fungal cultures) in sixteen of sixteen trials, while stationed from one to fifteen miles away (Tedder and Monty, 1981).

(c) Sixty subjects not known to have such abilities were able both to impede and stimulate significantly the growth of cultures of bacteria (Nash, 1982).

(d) Sixty university volunteers were asked to alter the ability of a strain of the bacterium *Escherichia coli* to utilize lactose. This strain normally mutates from the inability to metabolize lactose ("lactose negative") to the ability to use it ("lactose positive") at a known rate. The subjects tried to influence nine test tubes of bacterial cultures - three for increased mutation from lactose negative to lactose positive, three for decreased mutation of lactose negative to lactose positive, and three tubes uninfluenced as controls. The bacteria mutated in the directions desired by the subjects (Nash, 1984).

(e) Seven subjects - two spiritual healers, one physician who was interested in and believed in spiritual healing, and four students with neither experience nor interest in healing - were asked to increase the growth of yeast in test tubes "by the mental method of his choice." 240 test tubes were used -- 120 for the mental intent, 120 for controls.

The spiritual healers and the believing physician produced significant results ($p < 0.00014$) and the indifferent students produced chance results (Haraldsson and Thorsteinsson, 1973).

(2) Can such an effect influence intact animals?

In twenty-one experiments conducted over a period of several years, healers tried to awaken mice more quickly from general anesthesia. These experiments were increasingly refined. In one variation, only the image of the experimental mouse was projected on a television monitor to the healer in a distant room, who tried to intervene mentally via the image. Nineteen of the twenty-one studies showed highly significant results: earlier recovery from anesthesia in the mice to whom positive mental intent was extended (Watkins and Watkins, 1971; Watkins, Watkins, and Wells, 1973; Wells and Klein, 1972; Wells and Watkins, 1975).

In a controlled experiment, a noncontact form of "laying on of hands" was employed in an attempt to cure mice of transplanted mammary adenocarcinoma. Three replications were done. Overall, 29 of 33 experimental mice (87.9 percent) were cured of the cancer, compared to 18 of 26 control mice on site (69.2 percent) and 0 of 8 control mice off site (0 percent). Later reinjection of tumor cells in treated, cured mice did not take (Bengston and Krinsley, 2000). Researchers injected 60 mice with a tumoral suspension. Half of the mice were treated with "negative PK" for 20 sessions and half were not, and the weight and volume of tumor growth was measured. The treated mice showed significantly less tumor growth than untreated mice ($P < 0.01$) (Onetto and Elguin, 1966).

(3) Can such an effect influence biochemical processes in humans?

Blood platelets isolated from healthy human volunteers were treated by a healer, who tried to influence the activity of the enzyme monoamine oxidase (MAO). MAO activity was measured before and after the mental intent in both intact and disrupted cells. The overall effect was to increase the variability of MAO activity relative to untreated control samples ($p < 0.001$) (Rein, 1985).

(4) Can such an effect influence human tissue?

Thirty-two subjects mentally attempted to prevent the hemolysis of human red blood cells (RBCs) in test tubes containing a hypotonic saline solution, as measured by standard spectrophotometric techniques. Significant differences were found between the "prevent" and control tubes ($p < 1.91 \times 10^{-5}$) (Braud, 1988).

(5) Can such an effect influence intact humans ?

Scores of controlled studies have demonstrated the correlation of positive mental intent with physiological effects in distant human beings. This material has been the subject of several reviews (Benor, 1990, 1993; Dossey, 1993; Solvvin, 1984). Among the studies:

(a) In a double-blind experiment involving 393 persons admitted to a coronary care unit, intercessory prayer was offered from a distance to roughly half the subjects. Significantly fewer patients in the prayer group required intubation/mechanical ventilation ($p < 0.002$) or antibiotics ($p < 0.005$), had cardiopulmonary arrests ($p < 0.02$), developed pneumonia ($p < 0.03$), or required diuretics ($p < 0.005$). Subjects in the prayer group had a significantly lower "severity score" based on their hospital course following admission ($p < 0.01$) (Byrd, 1988).

(b) In a double-blind experiment involving 990 consecutive patients who were admitted to the coronary care unit (CCU), patients were randomized to receive remote,

intercessory prayer or not. The first names of patients in the prayer group were given to a team of outside intercessors who prayed for them daily for 4 weeks. Patients were unaware they were being prayed for, and the intercessors did not know and never met the patients. The medical course from hospital admission to discharge was summarized in a CCU course score derived from blinded, retrospective chart review. The prayed-for group had about a 10 percent advantage compared to the usual-care group ($P = .04$) (Harris et al, 1999).

(c) In a double-blind experiment involving 40 patients with advanced AIDS, subjects were randomly assigned to a "distant healing" (DH) group or to a control group. Both groups were treated with conventional medications, but the DH group received distant healing for 10 weeks from healers located throughout the United States. Subjects and healers never met. At 6 months, blind chart review found that DH subjects acquired significantly fewer new AIDS-defining illnesses ($P = 0.04$), had lower illness severity ($P = 0.03$), and required significantly fewer doctor visits ($P = 0.01$), fewer hospitalizations ($P = 0.04$), and fewer days of hospitalization ($P = 0.04$). DH subjects also showed significantly improved mood compared with controls ($P = 0.02$) (Sicher et al, 1998).

(d) In thirteen experiments, the ability of sixty-two people to influence the physiology of 271 distant subjects was studied (Braud and Schlitz, 1983,1988,1989). These studies suggested that

(1) the distant effects of mental imagery compare favorably with the magnitude of effects of one's individual thoughts, feelings, and emotions on one's own physiology;

(2) the ability to use positive imagery to achieve distant effects is apparently widespread in the human population;

(3) these effects can occur at distances up to twenty meters (greater distances were not tested);

(4) subjects with a greater need to be influenced by positive mental intent - i.e., those for whom the influence would be beneficial -- seem more susceptible;

(5) the distant effects of intentionality can occur without the recipient's knowledge; (6) those participating in the studies seemed unconcerned that the effect could be used for harm, and no such harmful effects were seen; and

(6) the distant effects of mental intentionality are not invariable; subjects appear capable of preventing the effect if it is unwanted.

(7) Are these effects limited to human intentionality, or are they widespread in nature?

Claims that humans can achieve distant effects through mental intention is often met with skepticism and derision. These objections might be tempered if it can be shown that this ability is present in nonhuman species as well. Although we do not know what animals think and whether or not they are really intending, there nonetheless is evidence suggesting that "animal consciousness," however it may be defined, is capable of manifesting at a distance in ways not unlike those seen in humans.

(a) Researchers tested the possible influence of 80 groups of 15 chicks on a randomly moving robot carrying a lighted candle in an otherwise darkened room. Baby chicks prefer to be in the presence of light; could this preference somehow influence the movement of the candle-carrying robot? In 71% of the cases, the robot spent excessive time in the vicinity of the chicks. In the absence of the chicks, the robot

followed random trajectories. The overall results were statistically significant ($p < 0.01$) (Peoc'h, 1988, 1995).

(b) Researchers collected fifty-four accounts of animals who returned to their owners, sometimes over colossal distances. These instances were unexplainable by sensory cues or by homing instincts; the animals often traveled to places they had never been. These instances suggest some form of extended awareness (Dossey, 1989, p. 112; Rhine and Feather, 1962).

EXPLAINABLE BY SUGGESTION?

The distant effects of intentionality suggested herein cannot easily be explained by placebo-type influences such as suggestion and expectation. These studies are generally double-blind in design. Moreover, most of the studies in this field examine the distant effects of intentionality not on other humans but on lower organisms (bacteria, yeast, fungi), cells (red blood cells or other types of tissue), plants (germinating seeds, growing seedlings), rats, and mice. These organisms are assumed to be immune to the effects of suggestion and expectation, and they presumably do not think positively (Dossey, 1993).

NONLOCAL MODELS OF CONSCIOUSNESS

These effects cannot be accommodated by conventional models of consciousness, which generally assume that consciousness is either an emergent property of the brain or is identical with it. All such models are local in nature -- i.e., they assume that consciousness and its effects are localized to specific points in space (brains, bodies) and time (the present moment). Distant effects of intentionality are prohibited by such models. If the above phenomena are to be accommodated, our local models of the mind may have to yield to some type of model that is nonlocal (Dossey 1989, pp. 1-11). Such a model would not localize or restrict consciousness spatiotemporally.

ADVANTAGES OF A NONLOCAL MODEL

A nonlocal model of consciousness has several advantages.

* Such a model would be comprehensive. It would accommodate anomalous observations that do not fit within the current local models of the mind-brain relationship.

* Suggestions that consciousness is spatiotemporally extended are not new within science. For example, such proposals were advanced by Nobelist Erwin Schrödinger, one of the patriarchs of modern physics, as well as by the famous logician-mathematician Kurt Gödel (Dossey, 1989, p. 125 ff).

* A host of distant manifestations of consciousness have arisen in other fields of research, not mentioned here, which also require a nonlocal model of consciousness for their explanation (Jahn and Dunne, 1987; Radin and Nelson, 1989; Radin, 1997a).

* Nonlocal events have repeatedly been demonstrated experimentally within quantum physics, our most accurate science, for over two decades (Herbert, 1987, 1993).

Mind-body theorists are therefore not being asked to "invent" nonlocality. While the philosophical ramifications of quantum nonlocality are unclear, the experimental findings

appear to be no longer in doubt. The fact that physicists are free to contemplate nonlocality surely makes it more permissible for mind-body theorists to do the same. Cautions, however, are in order. It is currently unknown whether or not quantum nonlocality has any relationship whatever to the nonlocal events observed at the level of the mind, such as the distant effects of intentionality. Nobel physicist Brian Josephson has proposed that consciousness-mediated events represent a form of

"biological utilization" of quantum nonlocality, and that the nonlocality observed in the subatomic domain will eventually explain nonlocal events at the macroscopic, molar levels of life (Josephson and Pallikara-Villas, 1991). This suggestion remains unproved.

* Respected scholars in various fields - mathematics, physics, biology, and the cognitive sciences - including Nobelists, are offering theories that fully permit nonlocal manifestations of consciousness such as those seen in intercessory prayer (Dossey, 1997). As an example, mathematician David J. Chalmers has advanced the idea that consciousness is fundamental in the universe, perhaps on a par with matter and energy (Chalmers, 1995a, 1995b). Chalmers' view is widely considered to be the most fertile hypothesis currently circulating in the field of consciousness studies. Chalmers cites a recent proposal along the same lines by Nobel physicist Steven Weinberg, who suggests that consciousness may be subject to physical laws all its own, which a complete "theory of everything" may have to recognize (Chalmers, 1995). While not demonstrating that the effects of distant intentionality actually exist, these proposals are cordial to the possibility and permit the above data to be taken seriously.

British mathematician C. J. S. Clarke has also offered a sophisticated nonlocal theory of consciousness, which similarly regards consciousness as infinite in space and time (Clarke, 1995). Clarke's theory is anchored in an approach in mathematics known as quantum logic. These are only two among a score of provocative ideas about the possible nonlocal nature of the mind (Dossey, 1997). These hypotheses are important because they elevate the level of plausibility of intercessory prayer and distant healing.

THE MYSTERY OF CONSCIOUSNESS

Those who consider the distant effects of prayer to be implausible might be reminded that the origins of consciousness and its relationship to the brain and body are a mystery. Several outstanding scholars have emphasized our appalling ignorance about these matters. John Searle, one of the most distinguished philosophers in the field of consciousness, has said, "At our present state of the investigation of consciousness, we don't know how it works and we need to try all kinds of different ideas" (Searle, 1995). Philosopher Jerry A. Fodor has observed, "Nobody has the slightest idea how anything material could be conscious. Nobody even knows what it would be like to have the slightest idea about how anything material could be conscious. So much for the philosophy of consciousness" (Fodor, 1992). Recently Sir John Maddox, former editor of *Nature*, soberly stated, "The catalogue of our ignorance must...include the understanding of the human brain.... What consciousness consists of...is...a puzzle. Despite the marvelous success of neuroscience in the past century..., we seem as far away from understanding...as we were a century ago....The most important discoveries of the next 50 years are likely to be ones of which we cannot now even conceive" (Maddox, 1999). If these observers are anywhere near the truth, we should be hesitant in declaring emphatically what the mind can and cannot do.

THE FUTURE

One offers proposals such as these with hesitation, realizing in advance their extraordinary capacity to evoke not just skepticism but cynicism and derision as well. A response to the commonest criticisms of nonlocal manifestations of consciousness can be found elsewhere (Dossey, 1995, 1998; Honorton, 1993; Radin, 1997, pp 205-227).

However, the question is really not whether our current model of the mind-brain-body relationship will change, but what the new model will be. The prediction from this quarter is that future visions of consciousness will be nonlocal in nature and will transform modern healthcare (Dossey, 1999). Nonlocal models will not do away with

local

formulations. They will subsume, not exclude, them, just as the more comprehensive quantum-relativistic views in physics did not eradicate Newtonian concepts, which remain extraordinarily useful. We should acknowledge, however, that nonlocality is not an "explanation" for the distant effects of intentionality. No one, including physicists, understands how nonlocal events take place, although many suggestions have been put

forward. These are often based in information theory (Rubik, 1995). A novel hypothesis that relies on the quantum vacuum and zero point fields has recently been advanced by systems theorist Ervin Laszlo (Laszlo, 1995).

Some insist that we delay combining prayer with the use of drugs and surgical procedures in our hospitals and clinics until we have more evidence of prayer's effectiveness. Certainly further investigation of intercessory prayer is warranted, but we need not wait until all the answers are in before employing prayer adjunctively. This view is represented by Lancet editor Richard Horton in his "Precautionary Principle" (Horton, 1998). Horton states, "We must act on facts and on the most accurate interpretation of them, using the best information. That does not mean that we must sit back until we have 100 percent evidence about everything. When the...health of the individual is at stake...we should be prepared to take action to diminish those risks even when the scientific knowledge is not conclusive."

Skeptics of prayer are plentiful, of course, and skepticism should be encouraged in any area of science. However, skepticism can shade into a type of dogmatic materialism that excludes intercessory prayer in principle, as when Newton's colleagues condemned universal gravity as occult nonsense without weighing the evidence (Mills, 1996). Both true believers and committed disbelievers in intercessory prayer might heed the view of mathematical physicist and philosopher Alfred North Whitehead, who co-authored *Principia Mathematica* with Bertrand Russell (Whitehead, 1948):

The Universe is vast. Nothing is more curious than the self-satisfied dogmatism with which mankind at each period of its history cherishes the delusion of the finality of its existing modes of knowledge. Sceptics and believers are all alike. At this moment scientists and sceptics are the leading dogmatists. Advance in detail is admitted: fundamental novelty is barred. This dogmatic common sense is the death of philosophical adventure. The Universe is vast.

*

REFERENCES

- Barry J. 1968. General and comparative study of the psychokinetic effect on a fungus culture. *Journal of Parapsychology*. 32: 237-43.
- Bengston WF, Krinsley D. The effect of the "laying on of hands" on transplanted breast cancer in mice. *Journal of Scientific Exploration*. 2000;14(3):353-364.
- Benor DJ. 1990. Survey of spiritual healing research. *Complementary Medical Research*. 4(1): 9-33.
- Benor DJ. 1993. *Healing Research*. Vols. 1-2. Munich: Helix Verlag.
- Braud W. 1990. Distant mental influence of rate of hemolysis of human red blood cells. *Journal of the American Society for Psychical Research*. 84 (1): 1-24.
- Braud W, Schlitz M. 1983. Psychokinetic influence on electrodermal activity. *Journal of Parapsychology* . 47(2): 95-119.

- Braud W, Schlitz M. 1988. Possible role of intuitive data sorting in electrodermal biological psychokinesis (bio-PK). In: *Research in Parapsychology 1987*. Metuchen, NJ: 5-9.
- Braud W, Schlitz M. 1989. A methodology for the objective study of transpersonal imagery. *Journal of Scientific Exploration*. 3(1): 43-63.
- Byrd R. 1988. Positive therapeutic effects of intercessory prayer in a coronary care unit population. *Southern Medical Journal*. 81(7): 826-9.
- Chalmers DJ. 1995. The puzzle of human consciousness. *Scientific American* . 273(6): 80-6.
- Clarke CJS. 1995. The nonlocality of mind. *Journal of Consciousness Studies*. 2(3):231-40.
- Dossey L. 1989. *Recovering the Soul*. New York: Bantam: 112-116.
- Dossey L. Erwin Schrödinger. 1989. *Recovering the Soul*. New York: Bantam: 125-137.
- Dossey L. 1993. *Healing Words*. San Francisco: Harper Collins/Harper San Francisco.
- Dossey L. 1995. Response to Gracely. *Alternative Therapies in Health and Medicine*. 1(5): 105-8.
- Dossey L. 1997. Emerging theories. In: The return of prayer. *Alternative Therapies in Health and Medicine*. 3(6):10-17, 133-120.
- Dossey L. 1998. The right man syndrome. *Alternative Therapies in Health and Medicine*. 4(3): 12-19, 108-114.
- Dossey L. 1999. *Reinventing Medicine*. San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco; .
- Dossey L. Prayer and medical science. 2000. *Archives of Internal Medicine*. 160(12):1735-1738.
- Fodor J. July 3, 1992. The big idea. *The [New York] Times Literary Supplement* :20.
- Haraldsson E, Thorsteinsson T. 1973. Psychokinetic effects on yeast. An exploratory experiment. *Research in Parapsychology*. Metuchen, NJ: Scarecrow Press: 20-21.
- Harris W, Gowda M, Kolb JW, Strychacz CP, Vacek JL, Jones PG, Forker A, O'Keefe JH, McCallister BD. 1999. A randomized, controlled trial of the effects of remote, intercessory prayer on outcomes in patients admitted to the coronary care unit. *Archives of Internal Medicine*. 159(19):2273-2278.
- Herbert N. 1987. *Quantum Reality*. Garden City, NY: Anchor/Doubleday.
- Herbert N. 1993. *Elemental Mind*. New York: Dutton.
- Honorton C. 1993. Rhetoric over substance: The impoverished state of skepticism. *Journal of Parapsychology*. 57(2):191-214.
- Horton R. 1998. The new public health of risk and radical engagement. *Lancet*.

352:251-252.

Jahn RG, Dunne BJ. 1987. *Margins of Reality: The Role of Consciousness in the Physical World*. New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich.

Josephson B, Pallikara-Villas F. 1991. Biological utilization of quantum nonlocality. *Foundations of Physics*. 21: 197-207.

Laszlo E. 1995. *The Interconnected Universe*. Singapore: World Scientific.

Maddox J. 1999. The unexpected science to come. *Scientific American*. 281(6):62-67.

Mills E. 1996. Giving up on the hard problem of consciousness. *Journal of Consciousness Studies*. 3(1):26-32.

Monty W, Monty M. 1981. Exploration of long-distance PK: A conceptual replication of the influence on a biological system. *Research in Parapsychology 1980*. 90-93

Nash CB. 1982. Psychokinetic control of bacterial growth. *Journal of the American Society for Psychical Research*. 51: 217-21.

Nash CB. 1984. Test of psychokinetic control of bacterial mutation. *Journal of the American Society for Psychical Research*. 78 (2): 145-52.

Onetto B, Elguin GH. Psychokinesis in experimental tumorigenesis. (Abstract of dissertation in psychology, University of Chile 1964.) *Journal of Parapsychology*. 1966;30:220. See comments by Campbell, Anthony, in: *Journal of Society for Psychical Research*. 1968;44:428.

Peo'h R. 1988. Chicken imprinting and the tyroscope: An Anpsi experiment. *Journal of the Society for Psychical Research*. 55: 1.

Peo'h R. 1995. Psychokinetic action of young chicks on the path of an illuminated source. *Journal of Scientific Exploration*. 9 (2): 223-29.

Radin D. 1997. *The Conscious Universe*. San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco.

Radin DI, Nelson RD. 1989. Evidence for consciousness-related anomalies in random physical systems. *Foundations of Physics*. 19:1499-1514.

Rein G. 1986. A psychokinetic effect on neurotransmitter metabolism: Alterations in the degradative enzyme monoamine oxidase. In: Weiner, Debra H. and Radin, Dean (Eds.): *Research in Parapsychology 1985*. Metuchen, NJ: Scarecrow Press. 77-80.

Rhine JB, Feather SR. 1962. The study of cases of "psi-trailing" in animals. *Journal of Parapsychology*. 26 (1): 1-21.

Rubik B. 1995. Energy medicine and the unifying concept of information. *Alternative Therapies in Health and Medicine*. 1(1): 34-9.

Searle J. 1995. Quotation on front cover. *Journal of Consciousness Studies*. 2(1).

Sicher F, Targ E, Moore D, Smith HS. 1998. A randomized double-blind study of the effect of distant healing in a population with advanced AIDS - report of a small-scale study. *Western Journal of Medicine*. 169(6):356-363.

Solfvin J. 1984. Mental healing. In: Krippner Stanley (Ed.) *Advances in Parapsychological Research*. Jefferson, NC: McFarland: 31-63.

Watkins GK, Watkins AM. 1971. Possible PK influence on the resuscitation of anesthetized mice. *Journal of Parapsychology* . 35 (4): 257-72.

Watkins GK, Watkins AM, Wells RA. 1973. Further studies on the resuscitation of anesthetized mice. *Research in Parapsychology 1972*. Metuchen, NJ: Scarecrow Press: 157-59.

Wells R, Klein J. 1972. A replication of a 'psychic healing' paradigm. *Journal of Parapsychology*. 36: 144-47.

Wells R, Watkins G. 1975. Linger effects in several PK experiments. *Research in Parapsychology 1974*. Metuchen, NJ: Scarecrow Press: 143-47.

Whitehead AN. 1948. *Essays in Science and Philosophy*. New York, NY: Philosophical Library:129.

GENERAL REFERENCES TO HEALING

(Updated 12 May, 2001)

Better times for spirituality and healing in medicine. Research News. February 2001; 1(6):12 (79 med schoolsŠ.) (no author)

CAM on PubMed, a new resource, is launched. Complementary & Alternative Medicine at the NIH. Spring 2001; VIII(2):3. [no author]

Ahuja, Anjana. Where is the next Einstein? [The Times of London](#). February 26, 2001. Downloaded April 16, 2001.

Anick D. Letter to editor. *Alternative Therapies in Health and Medicine*. May 2000;6(3):23 & 119.

Assessing the efficacy and safety of medical technologies. Washington, DC: Congressional Office of Technology Assessment; 1978:7.

Astin JA. Why Patients Use Alternative Medicine-Results of a National Survey. *JAMA* 1998;279(19):1548-1553.

Astin JA, Harkness E, Ernst E. The efficacy of "distant healing": A systematic review of randomized trials. *Annals of Internal Medicine*. 2000;132(11):903-10.

Astrow AB, Puchalski CM, Sulmasy DP. Religion, spirituality, and health care: Social, ethical, and practical considerations. *American Journal of Medicine*. 2001;110:283-287.

Balducci, C. (1968). Parapsychology and diabolic possession. *International Journal of Parapsychology*, 193-212

Barry J. General and comparative study of the psychokinetic effect on a fungus culture. *Journal of Parapsychology*. 1968; 32: 237-43.

Bem DJ, Honorton C. Does psi exist? Replicable evidence for an anomalous process of information transfer. *Psychological Bulletin*. 1994;115:4.

Bengston WF, Krinsley D. The effect of the "laying on of hands" on transplanted breast cancer in mice. *Journal of Scientific Exploration*. 2000;14(3):353-364.

Benor DJ. 1990. Survey of spiritual healing research. *Complementary Medical Research*. 4(1): 9-33.

Benor DJ. 1993. *Healing Research*. Vols. 1-2. Munich: Helix Verlag.

Bentwich Z, Kreitler S. Psychological determinants of recovery from hernia operations. Paper presented at Dead Sea Conference; June 1994; Tiberias, Israel.

Bergin AE, Jensen JP. Religiosity of psychotherapists: a national study. *Psychotherapy*. 1990;27(1):3-7

Braud W. Wellness implications of retroactive intentional influence: exploring an outrageous hypothesis. *Alternative Therapies in Health & Medicine*. 2000;6(1): 37-48.

Braud W. 1990. Distant mental influence of rate of hemolysis of human red blood cells. *Journal of the American Society for Psychical Research*. 84 (1): 1-24.

Braud WG. Human interconnectedness: Research indications. *ReVision*. 1992;14(3):140-148.

Braud WG. Healing analog research and human connectedness. Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the Society for the Scientific Study of Religion and the Religious Research Association, Virginia Beach, Virginia, November 9-11, 1990. See also: Braud WG. Human interconnectedness: Research indications. *ReVision*. 1992;14(3):140-148.

Braud W, Schlitz M. 1983. Psychokinetic influence on electrodermal activity. *Journal of Parapsychology*. 47(2): 95-119.

Braud W, Schlitz M. 1988. Possible role of intuitive data sorting in electrodermal biological psychokinesis (bio-PK). In: *Research in Parapsychology 1987*. Metuchen, NJ: 5-9.

Braud W, Schlitz M. 1989. A methodology for the objective study of transpersonal imagery. *Journal of Scientific Exploration*. 3(1): 43-63.

Broad CD. *Lectures in Psychical Research*. London, England: Routledge and Kegan Paul;1962:6.

Broughton RS. *Parapsychology: The Controversial Science*. New York, NY: Ballantine;1991.

Browner WS, Goldman L. Distant healing: An unlikely hypothesis *American Journal of Medicine* 2000;108:507-508.

Bunnell, Toni. The effect of "healing with intent" on pepsin enzyme activity. *Journal of Scientific Exploration*. 1999;13(2):139-148.

Byrd R. 1988. Positive therapeutic effects of intercessory prayer in a coronary care unit population. *Southern Medical Journal*. 1988; 81(7): 826-9.

- Chalmers DJ. 1995. The puzzle of conscious experience. *Scientific American* . 273(6): 80-6.
- Clarke CJS. The nonlocality of mind. *Journal of Consciousness Studies*. 1995;2(3):231-40.
- Daaleman TP, Frey B. Spiritual and religious beliefs and practices of family physicians: A national survey. *Journal of Family Practice*. 1999;48(2):98-109.
- Dossey L. 1989. *Recovering the Soul*. New York: Bantam: 112-116..
- Dossey L. 1995. Response to Gracely. *Alternative Therapies in Health and Medicine*. 1(5): 105-8.
- Dossey L. Healing and modern physics: exploring the small-is-beautiful assumption. *Alternative Therapies in Health and Medicine*. 1999;5(4):12-17, 102-108.
- Dossey L. The forces of healing: reflections on energy, consciousness, and the beef Stroganoff principle. *Alternative Therapies in Health and Medicine*. 1997;3(5):8-14.
- Dossey L. Energy talk. The Network. *The Scientific and Medical Network Review*. April 1997; 63: 3-7.
- Dossey L. 1998. The right man syndrome. *Alternative Therapies in Health and Medicine*. 4(3): 12-19, 108-114.
- Dossey L. 1999. *Reinventing Medicine*. San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco.
- Dossey L. Prayer and medical science. 2000. *Archives of Internal Medicine*. 160(12):1735-1738.
- Dossey L. Erwin Schrödinger. 1989. *Recovering the Soul*. New York: Bantam: 125-137.
- Dossey L. 1993. *Healing Words*. San Francisco: Harper Collins/Harper San Francisco.
- Dossey L. *Be Careful What You Pray For....* San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco; 1997.
- Dossey L. Emerging theories. In: The return of prayer. *Alternative Therapies in Health and Medicine*. 1997;3(6):10-17, 133-120.
- Dossey L. Energy talk. The Network. *The Scientific and Medical Network Review*. April 1997; 63: 3-7.
- Dossey L. Prayer and medical science. *Archives of Internal Medicine*. June 26, 2000;160(12):1735-1738.
- Eisenberg DM, Kessler RC, Foster C, Norlock FF, Calkins DR, Delbanco TL. Unconventional medicine in the United States. Prevalence, costs, and patterns of use. *New England Journal of Medicine*. 1993;328:246-252.
- Eisenberg DM, Davis RB, Ettner SL, et al. Trends in alternative medicine use in the United States, 1990-1997: results of a follow-up national survey. *JAMA*. 1998;280:1569-1575.

Ernst - see Resch

Evans D. *Spirituality and Human Nature*. Albany, NY: SUNY Press; 1993.2000;160(12):1735-1738.

Fodor J. The big idea. *The [New York] Times Literary Supplement*. July 3, 1992:20.

Goodkin K, Baldewicz TT, Asthana D, Khamis I, Blaney NT, et al. A bereavement support group of group intervention affects plasma burden of human immunodeficiency virus type1. Report of a randomized controlled trial. *Journal of Human Virology*. 2001;4(1):44-54.

Goswami A, with Reed RE, Goswami A. *The Self-Aware Universe: How Consciousness Creates the Material World*. New York, NY: Jeremy P. Tarcher/Putnam; 1993.

Grad, Bernard R. A telekinetic effect on plant growth: I. *International Journal of Parapsychology*. 1963;5(2):117-134.

Grad, Bernard R. A telekinetic effect on plant growth: II. Experiments involving treatment of saline in stoppered bottles. *International Journal of Parapsychology*. 1964(a);6:473-498.

Grad, Bernard R. A telekinetic effect on plant growth: III. Stimulating and inhibiting effects. Research brief, presented to the Seventh Annual Convention of the Parapsychological Association, Oxford University, Oxford, England, September 1964(b).

Grad, Bernard R. Some biological effects of laying-on of hands: A review of experiments with animals and plants. *Journal of the American Society for Psychical Research*. 1965(a); 59:95-127. (Also reproduced in: Schmeidler, Gertrude (Ed.): *Parapsychology: Its Relation to Physics, Biology, Psychology and Psychiatry*. Metuchen, NJ: Scarecrow Press;1976).

Grad, Bernard R. PK effects of fermentation of yeast. *Proceedings of the Parapsychological Association*. 1965(b);2:15-16.

Grad, Bernard R. The laying-on of hands: Implications for psychotherapy, gentling and the placebo effect. *Journal of the Society for Psychical Research*. 1967;61(4):286-305. (Also reproduced in: Schmeidler, Gertrude (Ed.): *Parapsychology: Its Relation to Physics, Biology, Psychology and Psychiatry*. Metuchen, NJ: Scarecrow Press;1976).

Grad, Bernard R; Cadoret, R.J.; Paul, G.I. The influence of an unorthodox method of treatment on wound healing in mice. *International Journal of Parapsychology*. 1961;3:5-24.

Greeley A. *The Sociology of the Paranormal: A Reconnaissance*. Beverly Hills, Calif: Sage Publications, 1975.

Greeley A. The impossible: it's happening. *Noetic Sciences Review*. Spring 1987:7-9.

Greenfield, Susan. Interview by Chris Floyd. Growing into the light: the matter and mystery of consciousness. Interview with Susan Greenfield. *Science & Spirit*. March/April 2000; 11(1):26-29.

Griffin DR. *Parapsychology, Philosophy, and Spirituality: A Postmodern Exploration*. Albany, NY: SUNY Press;1997:264.

Griffin DR. *Parapsychology, science, and religion*. In: *Religion and Scientific Naturalism: Overcoming the Conflicts*. Chapter 7. Albany, NY: SUNY Press;2000:179-240.

Grimes DA. Technology follies. *JAMA*. 1993;269(23):3030-33.

O'Laoire S. An experimental study of the effects of distant, intercessory prayer on self-esteem, anxiety, and depression. *Alternative Therapies in Health and Medicine*. 1997;3(6):39-53.

Haraldsson E, Thorsteinsson T. 1973. Psychokinetic effects on yeast. An exploratory experiment. *Research in Parapsychology*. Metuchen, NJ: Scarecrow Press: 20-21.

Harman WW. *A re-examination of the metaphysical foundations of modern science*. Petaluma, CA: The Institute of Noetic Sciences; 1991.

Harris W, Gowda M, Kolb JW, Strychacz CP, Vacek JL, Jones PG, Forker A, O'Keefe JH, McCallister BD. A randomized, controlled trial of the effects of remote, intercessory prayer on outcomes in patients admitted to the coronary care unit. *Archives of Internal Medicine*. 1999;159(19):2273-2278.

Herbert N. 1987. *Quantum Reality*. Garden City, NY: Anchor/Doubleday.

Herbert N. 1993. *Elemental Mind*. New York: Dutton.

Hobson A. In: David Fontana, Buddhism and Western neuroscience. *Network*. August 2000;73:2-6.

Honorton C. 1993. Rhetoric over substance: The impoverished state of skepticism. *Journal of Parapsychology*. 57(2):191-214.

Honorton C, Ferrari DC. "Future telling": A meta-analysis of forced-choice precognition experiments, 1935-1987. *Journal of Parapsychology*. 1989;53:281-308

Horton R. Editorial. *Lancet*. July 25, 1998; 352(9124):251-2.

Hyman R. Evaluation of a program on anomalous mental phenomena. *Journal of Scientific Exploration*. 1996;10(1):31-58.

Jahn RG, Dunne BJ. 1987. *Margins of Reality: The Role of Consciousness in the Physical World*. New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich.

Jahn RG, Dunne BJ, Nelson RD. Engineering anomalies research. *Journal of Scientific Exploration*. 1987;1(1):21-50.

Jonas WB. The middle way: Realistic randomized controlled trials for the evaluation of spiritual healing. *The Journal of Alternative and Complementary Medicine*. 2001;7(1):5-7.

Josephson B, Pallikara-Villas F. 1991. Biological utilization of quantum nonlocality. *Foundations of Physics*. 21: 197-207.

Koenig H. Exploring links between religion/spirituality and health. *The Scientific Review*

of *Alternative Medicine*. 1999;3(1):52-55.

Koenig HG, McCullough ME, Larson DB. *Handbook of Religion and Health*. New York: Oxford University Press; 2001.

Krucoff M. Interview by Bonnie Horrigan. The MANTRA study project. *Alternative Therapies in Health and Medicine*. 1999;5(3):74-82.

Larson EJ, Witham L. Scientists are still keeping the faith. *Nature*. 3 April 1997;386:435-6.

Larson EJ, Witham L. Leading scientists still reject god. *Nature*. July 23, 1998;394:313.

Larson EJ, Witham L. Scientists and religion in America. *Scientific American*. September, 1999; 88-93.

Laskow L. See Smith AL below....

Laszlo E. *The Interconnected Universe*. Singapore: World Scientific; 1995.

Lazarou J, Pomeranz BH, Corey PN. Incidence of adverse drug reactions in hospitalized patients. *JAMA*. 1998;279(15):1200-1205.

LeShan L. Language in the human potential movement. *Network*. August 1996;61:11-14.

Lewis CS. *Letters to Malcolm: Chiefly on Prayer*. New York, NY: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich; 1964:114.

Levin J. *God, Faith, and Health*. New York, NY. John Wiley & Sons; 2001.

Maddox J. The unexpected science to come. *Scientific American*. December 1999;281(6):62-67.

McClay, Wilfred M. Two concepts of secularism. *Wilson Quarterly*. Summer 2000: 54-71.

McCullough ME, Hoyt WT, Larson DB, Koenig H, Thoresen C. Religious involvement and mortality: A meta-analytic review. *Health Psychology*. 2000;19(3):211-222.

Mills E. 1996. Giving up on the hard problem of consciousness. *Journal of Consciousness Studies*. 3(1):26-32.

Mitchell E. Nature's mind: the quantum hologram. International Space Sciences Organization. Web site: <http://www.isso.org/inbox/nature.htm>. July 4, 2000.

Monty W, Monty M. 1981. Exploration of long-distance PK: A conceptual replication of the influence on a biological system. *Research in Parapsychology 1980*. 90-93

Muesham DJ et al., Effects of qigong on cell-free myosin phosphorylation: Preliminary experiments. *Subtle Energies*. 1994;5(1):93-108.

Murphy M. *The Future of the Body*. Los Angeles: Jeremy P. Tarcher, Inc.; 1992: 345.

Nash CB. 1982. Psychokinetic control of bacterial growth. *Journal of the American*

Society for Psychical Research. 51: 217-21.

Nash CB. 1984. Test of psychokinetic control of bacterial mutation. *Journal of the American Society for Psychical Research*. 78 (2): 145-52.

Nuland SB. Medical fads: bran, midwives and leeches. *New York Times*. June 25, 1995.

Onetto B, Elguin GH. Psychokinesis in experimental tumorigenesis. (Abstract of dissertation in psychology, University of Chile 1964.) *Journal of Parapsychology*. 1966;30:220. See comments by Campbell, Anthony, in: *Journal of Society for Psychical Research*. 1968;44:428.

Peoc'h R. 1988. Chicken imprinting and the tyroscope: An Anpsi experiment. *Journal of the Society for Psychical Research*. 55: 1.

Peoc'h R. 1995. Psychokinetic action of young chicks on the path of an illuminated source. *Journal of Scientific Exploration*. 9 (2): 223-29.

Price GR. Science and the supernatural. *Science*. 1955;122:359-367.

Radin D. *The Conscious Universe*. San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco, 1997.

Radin DI, Nelson RD. 1989. Evidence for consciousness-related anomalies in random physical systems. *Foundations of Physics*. 19:1499-1514.

Rauscher EA. Human volitional effects on a model bacterial system. *Subtle Energies*. 1990;1(1):21-41.

Rein G. 1986. A psychokinetic effect on neurotransmitter metabolism: Alterations in the degradative enzyme monoamine oxidase. In: Weiner, Debra H. and Radin, Dean (Eds.): *Research in Parapsychology 1985*. Metuchen, NJ: Scarecrow Press. 77-80.

Resch KI, Ernst E, Garrow J. Randomized controlled study of reviewer bias against unconventional therapy. *Journal of the Royal Society of Medicine*. 2000;93:164-167.

Rhine JB, Feather SR. 1962. The study of cases of "psi-trailing" in animals. *Journal of Parapsychology*. 26 (1): 1-21.

Robinson, James C. The end of managed care. *JAMA*. May 23, 2001;285(20):2622-28.

Rogo, D.S. (1974). Demonic possession and parapsychology. *Parapsychology Review*, 5(6), 18-24.

Rubik B. 1995. Energy medicine and the unifying concept of information. *Alternative Therapies in Health and Medicine*. 1(1): 34-9.

Sampson W. Quoted in: Wheeler DL. From homeopathy to herbal therapy, researchers focus on alternative medicine. *Chronicle of Higher Education*. March 27, 1998:A20-21.

Schwartz SA, De Mattei RJ, Brame Jr EG, Spottiswoode JP. Infrared spectra alteration in water proximate to the palms of therapeutic practitioners. *Subtle Energies*. 1990;1(1):43-72.

Schwartz SA *NIH and the Harkin Directive: Subtle Energies and Social Policy*. Mobius

Technical Report 1996.

Searle J. Quotation on front cover. *Journal of Consciousness Studies*. 1995;2(1).

Sered S. Susan Sered talks about religion and health at Harvard. Interview by Walton Jones. *Research News*, February 2001;1(6):14, 30.

Sheldrake R. How widely is blind assessment used in scientific research? *Alternative Therapies in Health and Medicine*. 1999;5(3):88-91.

Sicher F, Targ E, Moore D, Smith HS. A randomized double-blind study of the effect of distant healing in a population with advanced AIDS - report of a small-scale study. *Western Journal of Medicine*. 1998;169(6):356-363.

Sloan RP, Bagiella E, Powell T. Religion, spirituality, and medicine. *Lancet*. 1999;353(9153):664-667.

Smith R. Where is the wisdom? *British Medical Journal*. 1991;303:798-99.

Solfvin J. 1984. Mental healing. In: Krippner Stanley (Ed.) *Advances in Parapsychological Research*. Jefferson, NC: McFarland: 31-63.

Smith AL, Laskow L, Intentional healing in cultured breast cancer cells. The Academy of Religion and Psychical Research. Annual Conference 2000 Proceedings, p. 96.

Stapp H. Harnessing science and religion: Implications of the new scientific conception of human beings. *Research News*. February 2001; 1(6):8.

Starfield B. Is US health really the best in the world? *JAMA*. 2000;284(4):483-485.

Stoeber M, Meynell H, eds. *Critical Reflections on the Paranormal*. Albany, NY: SUNY Press; 1996.

Tart CT. *Body, Mind, Spirit: Exploring the Parapsychology of Spirituality*. Charlottesville, VA: Hampton Roads; 1997.

Targ E...see Sicher above.

Targ R, Puthoff H. *Mind-Reach. Scientists Look at Psychic Ability*. New York, NY: Delta; 1977:169. Also: Editorial, Scanning the issue. Proceedings of the IEEE, March 1976); LXIV(3):291.

Tedder, William H. and Monty, Melissa L. Exploration of long-distance PK: A conceptual replication of the influence on a biological system. In *Research in Parapsychology 1980*. Edited by W. G. Roll, et al. Metuchen, NJ: Scarecrow Press. 1981;90-93.

Thomas L. *The Medusa and the Snail*. New York: Penguin, 1995:73, 174-175.

Tiller, William, Dibble, Jr, Walter E., and Hohane, Michael J. *Exploring robust interactions between human intention and inanimate/animate systems, Part 1: Experimental, Frontier Perspectives: The Center for Frontier Sciences at Temple University*, 2000, 9(2), 6-22.

Townes C. Nobel laureate speaks at JFK University. *Research News*. February 2001;1(6):13.

Ullman M, Krippner S, with Vaughan A. *Dream Telepathy: Experiments in Nocturnal ESP*, 2d ed. Jefferson, NC: McFarland, 1989:111-112.

Utts J. The significance of statistics in mind-matter research. *Journal of Scientific Exploration*. 1999;12(4):615-638.

Utts J. An assessment of the evidence for psychic functioning. *Journal of Scientific Exploration*. 1999;10(1):3-30.

Wallace A. The contributions of Buddhism. *Research News*. February 2001; 1(6):7.

Wallis C. Faith and healing. *Time*. June 24, 1996:58-63.

Watkins GK, Watkins AM. Possible PK influence on the resuscitation of anesthetized mice. *Journal of Parapsychology*. 1971;35 (4): 257-72.

Watkins GK, Watkins AM, Wells RA. 1973. Further studies on the resuscitation of anesthetized mice. *Research in Parapsychology 1972*. Metuchen, NJ: Scarecrow Press: 157-59.

Wiesendanger, Harald, et al, Chronically ill patients treated by spiritual healing improve quality of life: results of a randomized waiting-list controlled study, *J. of Alternative and Complementary Medicine 2001*, 7(1), 45-51

Wells R, Klein J. 1972. A replication of a 'psychic healing' paradigm. *Journal of Parapsychology*. 36: 144-47.

Wells R, Watkins G. 1975. Linger effects in several PK experiments. *Research in Parapsychology 1974*. Metuchen, NJ: Scarecrow Press: 143-47.

Whitehead AN. *Essays in Science and Philosophy*. New York, NY: Philosophical Library;1948:129.

Wiseman R, Schlitz M. Experimenter effects and the remote detection of staring. *Journal of Parapsychology*. 1997;61:197-208.

Meta-analyses of healing studies

Abbot, Neil C, Healing as a therapy for human disease: a systematic review, *Journal of Alternative and Complementary Medicine*, 2000, 6(2), 159-169.

This meta-analysis covers 59 randomized controlled studies, (including 10 dissertation abstracts and 5 pilot studies) of healing in humans up to the year 2000. Of 22 fully reported trials, 10 suggested significant effects. There were 8 studies rated as methodologically sound, of which 5 showed significant effects. The heterogeneity of the

studies precluded a meta-analysis. Small sample sizes in the 15 studies in the dissertations and pilot group may have contributed to the lack of significant effects in 11 of them. The inclusion of the the abstracts and pilot studies weakens this analysis.

Astin, John A/ Harkness, Elaine/ Ernst, Edzard, The efficacy of "distant healing": a systematic review of randomized trials, *Annals of Internal Medicine 2000*, 132, 903-910. <http://www.acponline.org/journals/annals/06jun00/astin.htm>

John Astin, assistant professor at the University of Maryland Medical School, Edzard Ernst, Chairman of the Department of Complementary Therapies at the University of Exeter in England, and Elaine Harkness, reviewed 23 studies: 5 with prayer healing, 11

with non-contact Therapeutic Touch, and 7 miscellaneous distant healing approaches. A positive effect was found in 57 percent of these. The study is a bit peculiar in including non-contact Therapeutic Touch as distant healing, but within the study this category is analyzed separately. Overall, for the 16 trials with double blinds, the average effect size was 0.40 ($p < .001$). For 10 TT studies meeting their selection criteria, the average effect size was 0.63 ($p < .003$). For the prayer studies the effect size was 0.25 ($p < .009$). For the "other" studies the average effect size was 0.38 ($p < .073$). The authors conclude that "the evidence thus far warrants further study." This is an acknowledgment (in research reviewers' terminology) that the evidence has merit.

A second acknowledgment was published in the New York Times, op-ed page, June 6, 2000, in the column "Vital Signs" by Eric Nagourney, titled, "A cautious nod to "Distance Healing." Previously, the *New York Times* was reluctant to acknowledge healing research as valid.

Braud, William and Schlitz, Marilyn. A methodology for the objective study of transpersonal imagery, *Journal of Scientific Exploration* 1989, 3(1), 43-63.

This meta-analysis focuses on electrodermal activity (EDA), a measure of skin resistance that reflects states of tension. Healers have been able to selectively lower and raise EDA, aided by feedback from a meter attached to the healee's skin. In a series of studies by William Braud and Marilyn Schlitz there were 323 sessions with 4 experimenters, 62 influencers and 271 subjects. Of the 15 studies, 6, (40 per cent) produced significant results. Of the 323 sessions, 57 percent were successful ($p = .000023$). That is, such results could have occurred by chance only twenty three times in a million.

Schlitz, Marilyn/ Braud, William, Distant intentionality and healing: assessing the evidence, *Alternative Therapies* 1997, 3(6), 62-73.

Analyzing 19 experiments in which one person sought to influence another person's electrodermal activity (EDA), they found highly significant effects ($p < .0000007$).

Winstead-Fry, Patricia/ Kijek, Jean, An integrative review and meta-analysis of Therapeutic Touch research, *Alternative Therapies* 1999, 5(6) 59-67.

Out of 29 dissertation and research studies that addressed questions of efficacy, 19 showed at least partial support for the research hypothesis. The other 10 rejected the hypotheses. Deficiencies in reporting details of the studies make it very difficult to compare studies. A moderate combined effect size was found (0.39) in the 13 studies that included means and standard deviations for treatment and control groups ($p < .001$).

Qualitative studies of healing

Barrington, Rosze, A naturalistic inquiry of post-operative pain after Therapeutic Touch (In: Delores A. Gaut and Anne Boykin, *Caring as Healing*, New York: National League for Nursing 1994)

Borg, Elizabeth W. *The Experience of Healing During Non-Ordinary States of Consciousness: An Heuristic Investigation*, Doctoral dissertation, Union Institute 1994

Cabico, Lucila Levarado, *A Phenomenological Study of the Experiences of Nurses Practicing Therapeutic Touch* (Master's thesis), Buffalo, NY: D'Youville College 1993.

Cooperstein, Allan, The myths of healing: a summary of research into transpersonal healing experiences, *Journal of the American Society for Psychological Research* 1992, 86, 99-133.

Also as: *The Myths of Healing: A Descriptive Analysis of Transpersonal Healing*, Doctoral dissertation, Saybrook Institute, California 1990.

Davis, Frank Stafford, *Charismatic Christian Spiritual healing in Two Cultural Contexts: An Existential-Phenomenological Approach*, Doctoral dissertation, Duke University 1990.

France, Nancy E.M. The child's perception of the human energy field using therapeutic touch, *Journal of Holistic Nursing* 1933, 11(4), 319-331.

Harris, Darryl James, *The Mystery and meaning of Reiki*, Bachelor of Health Science Thesis, University of Western Sydney Nepean (School of health & Nursing) 1998 (www.sites.netscape.net/strgzrdjh/thesis/title.html)

Heidt, Patricia Rose, Openness - A qualitative analysis of nurses' and patients' experiences of therapeutic touch, *Image: Journal of Nursing Scholarship* 1990, 22(3), 180-186

Hughes, Pamela Potter/ Meize-Grochowski, Robin/ Neighbor, Catherine/ Harris, Duncan, Therapeutic Touch with adolescent psychiatric patients, *Journal of Holistic Nursing* 1996, 14(1), 6-23

Kiernan, Jane S. *The Experience of Therapeutic Touch in the Lives of Five Postpartal Women* (Dissertation), NYC, New York University 1997.

MacNeil, Melanie Sue, *Therapeutic Touch and Tension Headaches: A Rogerian Study* (Master's thesis), D'Youville College 1995.

Markides, Emily Joannides, *Complementary Energetic Practices: An Exploration Into the World of Maine Women Healers* (Alternative Therapies, Healing), (dissertation) University of Maine 1996.

Nebauer, Monica, Healing through Therapeutic Touch: one person's perspective, in: Gaut, D.A./Boykin, A., *Caring as Healing*, New York: National League for Nursing 1994, 85-101 (single case study).

Pattison, E. Mansell, et al. Faith healing, *Journal of Nervous and Mental Diseases* 1973, 156, 397-409.

Peters, Pamela Joan, *The Lifestyle Changes of Selected Therapeutic Touch Practitioners: An Oral History* (Alternative Medicine), (dissertation), Walden University 1995.

Polk, S.H. *Client's Perceptions of Experiences Following the Intervention Modality of Therapeutic Touch* (Master's thesis) Tempe: Arizona State University 1985.

Renard, Ann M, *The Experience of Healing from Deprivation of Bonding* (Touch, Emotional Attachment), (dissertation) The Union Institute 1994.

Samarel, Nelda, The experience of receiving Therapeutic Touch, *Journal of Advanced Nursing* 1992, 17,651-657.

Tilley, James A. *A Phenomenology of the Christian Healer's Experience with Faith Healing*, Doctoral dissertation, Fuller Theological Seminary, School of Psychology 1989

Van Dragt, Ryan, *Paranormal Healing: A Phenomenology of the Healer's Experience, Vols. I & II*. Doctoral dissertation, Fuller Theological Seminary, School of Psychology

1980

Zambetis, Donna Blanche, *Attitudes of Women with Breast Cancer Toward Therapeutic Touch* (Master's thesis), Michigan State University 1996.

Schweitzer, Susan Fredricka, *The Effects of Therapeutic Touch on Short-Term Memory Recall in the Aging Population: A Pilot Study* (Master's thesis), Reno: University of Nevada 1980.

Thomas-Beckett, Julie Gwen, *Attitudes Toward Therapeutic Touch: A Pilot Study of Women with Breast Cancer* (Master's thesis) East Lansing: Michigan State University 1991.

Mitchell, Annie, Researching healing: a psychologist's perspective, *J. Alternative and Complementary Medicine* (UK) 2000, 6(2), 181-186
Advocates qualitative studies of healing

Surveys of healees' satisfaction with healing

Attevelt, J.T.M. *A Statistical Survey of the Patients of Paranormal Healers*, Amsterdam: Nederlands Federation for Paranormal and Naturopathic Healers (NFPNH) 1981.

Boucher, Faith Katherine, *The Cadences of Healing: Perceived Benefits from Treatment Among the Clientele of Psychic Healers*, Doctoral dissertation, University of California, Davis 1980.

Cohen, John, Spiritual healing: a complementary role in general practice, *Modern Medicine* 1990 (Sep), 663-665.

Haraldsson, Erlendur and Olafsson, Orn, A survey of psychic healing in Iceland, *Christian Parapsychologist* 1980, 3(8), 276-279.

Harvey, David, *The Power to Heal: An Investigation of Healing and the Healing Experience*, Wellingborough, England: Aquarian 1983.

Krippner, Stanley, A questionnaire study of experiential reactions to a Brazilian healer, *Journal of the Society for Psychical Research* 1990, 56, 208-215.

Riscalla, Louise Mead, A study of religious healers and healees, *Journal of the American Society for Psychosomatic Dentistry and Medicine* 1982, 29(3), 97-103.

Westerbeke, Patricia/ Gover, John/ Krippner, Stanley, Subjective reactions to the Philippino "healers:" a questionnaire study, In: Morris, J. D./ Roll, W. G./ Morris, R. L. (Eds), *Research in Parapsychology 1976*, Metuchen, NJ: Scarecrow 1977, 70-71.

Wharton, Richard and Lewith, George. Complementary medicine and the general practitioner, *British Medical Journal* 1986, 292.

Survey instrument for patient outcomes

An excellent questionnaire for physical and mental health is the SF-36, described in the following references.

Farr, Charles H. et al, Patient outcomes to alternative medicine therapies as measured by the SF-36 - preliminary report, *Townsend Letter* 1999, 186, 24-25. Medical Outcomes Trust, 20 Park Plaza, suite 1014, Boston, MA 02116-4313, promoting measuring tools that include patients and health caregivers.

Ware, J.E. et al, *SF-36 Health Survey Manual and Interpretation Guide*, Boston, MA: New England medical Center, The Health Institute, 1993.

Clinical observations, multiple case studies

Healing Research, Volume I includes a broad spectrum of reports by researchers on how healers work and on some of the effects they bring about in physical and psychological problems.. References of particular value, reviewed in Healing Research, include:

Casdorph, H. Richard, *The Miracles*, Plainfield, NJ, Logos International 1976. This is the best published series of case studies of healing, mostly by the late Katherine Kuhlman, reviewed by a physician.

Dowling, St. John., Lourdes cures and their medical assessment, *Journal of the Royal Society of Medicine* 1984, 77, 634-638.

Engel, Hans G., *Energy Healing*, Research Report Los Angeles, CA: Ernest Holmes Research Foundation 1978, 1-15. A physician shares some of his clinical experiences, integrating spiritual healing in his practice. (Summarized in Healing Research, Volume I)

Clinical observations, single case studies

Kirkpatrick, Richard A. Witchcraft and lupus erythematosus, *Journal of the American Medical Association* 1981, 245(9), 1937.

Nebauer, Monica, Healing through Therapeutic Touch: one person's perspective, in: Gaut, D.A./Boykin, A., *Caring as Healing*, New York: National League for Nursing 1994, 85-101.

Anecdotal reports of healers

There are numerous reports by healers on how they work and what they believe happens in spiritual healing.

References of particular value, reviewed in *Healing Research*, include:

Edwards, Harry, *Thirty Years a Spiritual Healer*, London: Herbert Jenkins 1968.

Edwards, Harry. *The Science Of Spirit Healing*, London: Rider 1945.

Gardner, Nancy and Gardner, Esmond, *Five Great Healers Speak Here*, Wheaton, IL: Quest 1982.

MacManaway, Bruce with Turcan, Johanna, *Healing: The Energy That Can Restore Health*, Wellingsborough, England: Thorsons 1983.

Tester, M. H. *The Healing Touch*, London: Psychic 1982 (Orig. 1970).

Turner, Gordon, *An Outline of Spiritual Healing*, London: Psychic Press 1970.

Turner, Gordon, *A Time to Heal: The Autobiography of an Extraordinary Healer*, London: Talmy, Franklin 1974.

Healers' perspectives on research

Brown, C. K. Methodological problems of clinical research into spiritual healing: the healer's perspective, *Journal of Alternative and Complementary Medicine* 2000, 6(2), 171-176.

Electroencephalographic (EEG) studies

Cade, Maxwell/ Coxhead, N. *The Awakened Mind*, 2nd ed. Shaftesbury, UK: Element 1986. Synchronization of both hemispheres during meditation, healing; EEG synchronizations of healers and healees. EEG biofeedback device displaying activity in both hemispheres 0.5-32 Hz.

Charman, Robert A, Placing healers, healees, and healing into a wider research context, *Journal of Alternative and Complementary Medicine* 2000, 6(2), 177-180. Brief review article (18 refs)

Dilbeck, MC/ Banus, CB/ Polanzi, C/ Landrith, GS, Test of a field model of consciousness and social change: the Transcendental Meditation and TM-Sidhi program and decreased urban crime, *Journal of Mind Behaviour* 1988, 9(4), 457-486. Left and Right hemispheric profiles synchronized 7-8 HZ, then group synchrony

Duane, TD/ Behrendt, T. Extrasensory electroencephalographic induction between identical twins, *Science* 1965, 150-367. EEGs synchronized for one twin closing eyes in 2/15 pairs.

Grinberg-Zylberbaum, J./ Delafior, M./ Sanchez Arellano, M. E./ Guevara, MA/ Perez, M. Human communication and the electrical activity of the brain, *Subtle Energies* 1992, 3(3), 25-41. Pairs of subjects feeling affinity for each other, startle response in one registered in EEG of other.

Orme-Johnson, D/ dillbeck, MC/ Wallace, RK/ Landrith, GS, Intersubject EEG coherence: Is consciousness a field? *International Journal of Neuroscience* 1982, 16, 203-209.

Seto, A/ Kusaka, C./ Nakazato, S. et al, Detection of extraordinary large biomagnetic field strength from the human hand during external qi emission, *Acupuncture and Electrotherapeutics Research International* 1992, 17, 75-94. Hands of healers emit EM fields during healing, 2-30 Hz

Sugano, H/ Uchida, S/ Kuramoto, I, A new approach to the study of subtle energies, *Subtle Energies* 1994, 5(2), 143-165. Multiple EM measurements show healer-healee interactions.

Zimmerman, J. New technologies detect effects in healing hands, *Brain/Mind Bulletin* 1985, 10(2), 20-23. Hands of healers emit EM fields during healing, 2-30 Hz

Related References

Eisenberg, David et al, Unconventional medicine in the United States: Prevalence, costs and patterns of use, *New England J. Medicine* 1993, 328, 246-252.

Eisenberg, David, et al. Trends in alternative medicine use in the United States, 1990-1997: results of a follow-up national survey, *Journal of the American Medical Association* 1998, 280(18), 1569-1575.
